

145202 - Is it proven in the hadeeth that the sun is in constant motion and never stops or disappears?

the question

I want to know if the following Hadeeth is authentic or not. The hadith below is used by some authors these days to prove the modern science.

Ibn Abbas narrated that the Prophet was asked:

“Where does the sun set, and where does it rise from? The Messenger of Allah (PBUH) answered, “It is going in a (nonstop) regular motion; it does not cease or disappear. It sets in one place and rises in another, and sets in another place and rises elsewhere and so on. So, some people would say the sun has set and others would say it has just risen (at the same moment).”

[Reported by Imam Abi Is-haq al Hamadhani in “Musnad Imam Abi Is-haq al-Hamadhani”].

Detailed answer

These words are not narrated from the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) with any isnaad, be it saheeh (sound) or da'eef (weak), and they do not resemble the words of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) or of the earliest generation.

Ibn al-Qayyim (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

The fabricated (mawdoo') hadeeths sound grim and are clumsily worded, with far-fetched ideas which clearly indicate that they have been fabricated and falsely attributed to the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him).

End quote from al-Manaar al-Muneef, p. 50

And he (may Allah have mercy on him) mentioned a number of general guidelines by which it may be known that a hadeeth is fabricated, one of which is that the hadeeth contradicts what is mentioned in the saheeh Sunnah. Another is that the words do not resemble the words of the Prophets, let alone the words of the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him), which are words of Revelation. Thus a fabricated hadeeth does not resemble the words of Revelation and does not even resemble the words of the Sahaabah.

See: al-Manaar al-Muneef, p. 56-62

Upon consideration, this hadeeth is of that type. It is more akin to the words of astronomers and geographers.

Moreover the words innaha li'l-taw ashraquat [translated above as "it has just (li'l-taw) risen"] indicate that it is a later fabrication. In classical, correct Arabic, this phrase "li'l-taw" would not be used in this context. This is more like the speech of the common folk (slang).

Moreover there is no scholar among those who compiled books on the Sunnah who was called Abu Ishaaq al-Hamadaani.

And Allah knows best.