

193186 - A munkar (odd) report accusing 'Aa'ishah of killing 'Uthmaan and wanting to kill 'Ali (may Allah have mercy on them all)

the question

Al-Balaadhuri narrated: Ahmad ibn Ibraaheem ar-Darooqi told me: Abu'n-Nadr told us: Ishaq ibn Sa'eed told us, from 'Umar ibn Sa'eed: Sa'eed ibn 'Amr told me, from Ibn Haatib who said: I went with 'Ali on the day of (the battle of) the Camel to the howdah [in which 'Aa'ishah was], and it looked like a hedgehog with bristles because of all the arrows. He struck the howdah then said: Verily this Humayra' [a nickname of 'Aa'ishah] wanted to kill me as she killed 'Uthmaan ibn 'Affaan.

Her brother Muhammad said to her: Has something happened to you?

She said: An arrow in my arm. He put his head in (the howdah), then pulled her towards him, then pulled it out.

Is this report saheeh or not?

Detailed answer

We do not know that this report was narrated by any of the scholars who have knowledge of reports and history, apart from Ahmad ibn Yahya al-Balaadhuri in his book *Ansaab al-Ashraaf* (2/249), where he says:

Ahmad ibn Ibraaheem ad-Dawraqi told me: Abu'n-Nasr told us: Ishaq ibn Sa'eed told us: from 'Amr ibn Sa'eed: Sa'eed ibn 'Amr told us, from Ibn Haatib who said: I went with 'Ali on the day of (the battle of) the Camel to the howdah [in which 'Aa'ishah was], and it looked like a hedgehog with bristles because of all the arrows. He struck the howdah then said:

Verily this Humayra' [a nickname of 'Aa'ishah] wanted to kill me as she killed 'Uthmaan ibn 'Affaan. Her brother Muhammad said to her: Has something happened to you? She said: An arrow in my arm. He put his head in (the howdah), then pulled her towards him, then pulled it out.

This report is munkar (odd), and is not saheeh (sound) in either its isnaad (chain of narrators) or matn (text).

Firstly:

'Amr ibn Sa'eed was either: the grandfather of Ishaq ibn Sa'eed, which is what appears to be the case, because his full name is Ishaq ibn Sa'eed ibn 'Amr ibn Sa'eed. Based on that, the isnaad is munqati' (interrupted), because the grandfather died in 70 AH (at-Tahdheeb, 8/34), and the grandson, the narrator, died in 170 AH (at-Tahdheeb, 1/204); there are one hundred years between the two deaths, so it is not possible that he could have heard from him. Based on that the isnaad is munqati' (interrupted) and da'eef (weak).

Or: he was someone else, in which case he is majhool (unknown). Based on that, the isnaad is also da'eef (weak). In either case there is an unknown narrator, and when a hadith is narrated only by an unknown narrator, then it is to be rejected.

Secondly:

How could 'Ali have said concerning 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) that she wanted to kill him as she had killed 'Uthmaan?!

This is pure falsehood. 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) is completely innocent of the blood of 'Uthmaan. She only went out at the battle of the Camel in an effort to bring about reconciliation among the Muslims. Ahmad (24133) narrated from Qays ibn Abi Haazim that 'Aa'ishah

said, when she came to Haw'ab and heard the dogs barking: I think that I should go back, for the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said to us: "At which of you will the dogs of Haw'ab bark?" az-Zubayr said to her: Do you want to go back? (Stay, for) perhaps Allah, may He be glorified and exalted, will bring about reconciliation among the people through you.

(23733): Some of those who were with her said: Rather proceed, for the Muslims will see you and Allah, may He be glorified and exalted, will bring about reconciliation among them thereby.

Classed as saheeh by al-Albaani in as-Saheehah (474).

Imam 'Uthmaan ibn Sa'eed ad-Daarimi (may Allah have mercy on him) said, with his isnaad going back to Naafi': 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) said: "By Allah, I fear that if I were to want him – meaning 'Uthmaan – to be killed, then I would be killed. But Allah knows from above His Throne that I did not want him to be killed.

Ar-Radd 'ala al-Jahamiyyah

by ad-Daarimi (83). There is a corroborating report via Mujaahid from 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) that was narrated by Na'eem ibn Hamaad in al-Fitan (202).

Ibn al-'Arabi (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

With regard to her going out to the battle of the Camel, she did not go out to fight, but the people put pressure on her and complained to her about what was happening of grave turmoil and people killing one another. They were seeking her blessing (barakah) and they hoped that people would feel shy before her (and refrain from fighting) if she stood before them. She also thought that, so she went out, because Allah, may He be exalted, says (interpretation of the meaning): "There

is no good in most of their secret talks save (in) him who orders Sadaqah (charity in Allah's Cause), or Ma'roof (Islamic Monotheism and all the good and righteous deeds which Allah has ordained), or conciliation between mankind/people" [an-Nisa' 4:114] and "And if two parties or groups among the believers fall to fighting, then make peace between them both" [al-Hujuraat 49:7]. The command to bring about reconciliation or make peace is addressed to all people, both male and female, free and slave. But Allah, may He be exalted, in accordance with His prior decree and wisdom, did not will that reconciliation should occur; rather fighting and casualties continued until both sides were almost eradicated, and some of them went to the Camel and hamstrung it. When the Camel fell down on its side, Muhammad ibn Abi Bakr went to 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) and took her to Basra. Then she set out with thirty women, whom 'Ali sent with her until they brought her back to Madinah safe and sound.

End quote from Tafseer al-Qurtubi (14/181).

Ibn Katheer (may Allah have mercy on him) said, describing the battle of the Camel:

The arrows reached the howdah of the Mother of the Believers 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her), and she started calling out: "Allah, Allah! O my sons, remember the Day of Reckoning!" And she raised her hands in supplication, praying against those people who had killed 'Uthmaan, and the people raised their voices with her in supplication, until the sound of their cries reached 'Ali and he said: What is this? They said: the Mother of the Believers is praying against the killers of 'Uthmaan and their supporters.

He said: O Allah, curse the killers of 'Uthmaan.

End quote from al-Bidaayah wa'n-Nihaayah (7/270)

Al-Bukhaari narrated in al-Adab al-Mufrad (828) that 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) said: Whoever reviles 'Uthmaan, upon him be the curse of Allah.

Ibn 'Asaakir narrated in his Tareekh (39/487) from her (may Allah be pleased with her) that she said: I got angry for you when you were wronged with the whip and you do not expect me to get angry for 'Uthmaan when he was wronged with the sword?! And when he responded to your objections, you killed him!

There are corroborating report narrated by Ibn 'Asaakir (39/487-488); at-Tabari in his Tareekh (3/82-83); and Ibn Khayyaat in his Tareekh (p. 39).

She also used to praise 'Ali and describe him as knowledgeable. Muslim (276) narrated that Shurayh ibn Haani' said: I asked 'Aa'ishah about wiping over the khuffayn and she said: Go to 'Ali, for he knows more about that than I do.

To conclude, this report is false and is made up and fabricated; it is not permissible to narrate it. 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) only went out at the battle of the Camel in order to reconcile between people. She did not participate in the killing of 'Uthmaan (may Allah be pleased with him) - not even as much as half a word - and neither did 'Ali. Rather she denounced that and did not approve of it. She did not seek the killing of 'Ali either, and that never crossed her mind. Allah, may He be exalted, protected her from what the fabricators claim.

Please see also the answers to questions no.

[954](#), [127028](#) and

[147974](#)

And Allah knows best.