

415957 - Did the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) forbid his daughter Fatimah to complain about her husband?

the question

My in-laws are from the Tablighi jamat and their scolar who came to our house said that we shld stop complain and gave refrence of the incident where Hazrat Fatima complained about Hazrat Ali 's big stomach wealth and quoted this When Fatimah came, the Prophet (Sallallaahu Alayhi Wasallam) asked her if she came to complain about Ali. She replied that she had. The Prophet (Sallallaahu Alayhi Wasallam) said: "By the Lord of the Ka'bah! Go back to Ali and tell him that you are prepared to rub your nose in dust in order to keep him happy. You may do as you please." (Jailul 'Uyoon: 61) Is this incident authentic or jus a made up story.

Detailed answer

We have not come across this report which speaks of Fatimah (may Allah be pleased with her) complaining to the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) about her husband 'Ali (may Allah be pleased with him).

With regard to women complaining about their husbands, that is not all at the same level. In some cases it is permissible, in order for the woman to ward off harm from herself or her faith.

An example of that is the report narrated by al-Bukhari (5364) and Muslim (1714) from 'A'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her), according to which Hind bint 'Utbah said: O Messenger of Allah, Abu Sufyan is a stingy man and he does not give me enough maintenance for myself and my children, except what I take from him without his knowledge. The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: "Take what is sufficient for you and your children, on a reasonable basis."



In the case of Fatimah (may Allah be pleased with her, when the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) feared that she would be put to trial, he listened to her complaint.

Al-Bukhari (3729) and Muslim (2449) narrated that al-Miswar ibn Makhramah said: 'Ali ibn Abi Taalib proposed to the daughter of Abu Jahl, and he was already married to Faatimah the daughter of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him). When Faatimah heard of that she came to the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) and said: Your people are saying that you do not get angry for the sake of your daughters, and 'Ali is going to marry the daughter of Abu Jahl.

The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) stood up and I heard him when he recited the shahadah, then he said: "I gave a daughter of mine in marriage to Abu'l-'As ibn ar-Rabi', and when he spoke he told me the truth. Fatimah bint Muhammad is a part of me, and I do not like to see her upset. By Allah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah and the daughter of the enemy of Allah will not be joined together as wives of one man." So 'Ali abandoned that proposal.

According to a report narrated by al-Bukhari (3110) and Muslim (2449) from al-Miswar ibn Makhramah, he said: 'Ali ibn Abi Talib proposed marriage to the daughter of Abu Jahl (to be a co-wife) to Fatimah, and I heard the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) addressing the people concerning that, on this minbar of his, and I was an adolescent at that time. He said: "Fatimah is part of me, and I fear lest she be put to trial with regard to her religious commitment."

Ibn Hajar (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

"and I fear lest she be put to trial with regard to her religious commitment" means: she will not be able to put up with jealousy, so if she became angry, she would treat her husband in a way that is not befitting to her commitment to Islam [because it would be contrary to Islamic teachings]."(*Fath al-Bari* 9/329).



With regard to problems that the Muslim woman is able to resolve through dialogue with her husband and with patience, it is more appropriate in this case for her not to complain.

Shaykh 'Abd al-'Aziz ibn Baz (may Allah have mercy on him) was asked:

The questioner is saying: I have a sister who is married, and she has problems with her husband and his family. When she comes to visit us, she tells us what is happening to her and her children, and she cries a great deal, because she is being mistreated a great deal. We advise her to be patient, but I wonder: does she have the right to do that when she is with us? May Allah reward you with good, what do you advise us to do?

Answer: we advise her to be patient, if her husband is a good man; we advise her to be patient and not complain to you and not tell you anything. Rather that should be between her and her husband. If she is able to ask his father, older brother or maternal or paternal uncle, if they are good, to advise him, if there is a need to do that, then there is nothing wrong with it. But whenever it is possible for her to solve her problems between her and him by herself, that is more appropriate. She should use good manners and good words, and show kindness, until he calms down, so that he can respond to her request, and she should not be harsh and tough, and should not forsake him and the like. Rather she should handle matters wisely, with good words and a kind approach.

The husband should fear Allah and treat his wife kindly, using good words and a gentle approach. Each of them should strive to show kindness and goodness, as Allah, may He be glorified and exalted, says (interpretation of the meaning):

{And live with them in kindness} [An-Nisa' 4:19]

{And due to the wives is similar to what is expected of them, according to what is reasonable} [Al-Baqarah 2:228]."(*Nur 'ala ad-Darb* 21/234).

And Allah knows best.