

459033 - Reading quran for the deceased

the question

I have read an article on your website regarding reciting quran for the deceased .In that you mentioned the opinion of imam an nawawi saying the majority of shafi say it won't reach him .I am from a shafi majority country . I spoke to the head imam of our mosque who is a shafi and he said that this is not true and he asked for evidence .. I searched for sharh muslim of imam an nawawi I didn't get a copy can you provide the difference of opinion within shafi madhab and the relied upon opinion of shafi madhab pls provide references and evidences that I can show my imam and guide them towards the truth .

Detailed answer

The jurists differed on whether the reward of recitation reaches the deceased, while they agreed on the reward of supplication, charity, and pilgrimage reaching them.

The well-known opinion of the Shafi`i school is that the reward of recitation does not reach the deceased.

An-Nawawi (may Allah have mercy on him) said in "Sharh Muslim" (1/90), Dar Ihya At-Turath Al-Arabi edition, Beirut: "As for the recitation of the Quran: the well-known opinion of the Shafi`i school is that its reward does not reach the deceased.

Some of his companions said: its reward does reach the deceased.

And groups of scholars have opined that the reward of all acts of worship, including prayer, fasting, recitation, and others, reaches the deceased. In Sahih Al-Bukhari, in the chapter on one who dies with an unfulfilled vow, it is reported that Ibn `Umar instructed the one whose mother died and had outstanding prayers to pray on her behalf

The author of Al-Hawi narrated from `Ata ibn Abu Rabah and Ishaq ibn Rahawayh that they permitted prayer on behalf of the deceased.

Shaykh Abu Sa`d Abdullah ibn Muhammad ibn Hibat Allah ibn Abu `Asrun, one of our later companions, inclined in his book Al-Intisar to choose this opinion.

Imam Abu Muhammad Al-Baghawi, one of our companions, said in his book At-Tahdhib: It is not far-fetched that for every prayer, a measure (mudd) of food should be given on behalf of the person.

All these opinions are weak, and their evidence is analogy to supplication, charity, and pilgrimage, for their reward reaches by consensus.

The evidence of Ash-Shafi`i and his supporters is the saying of Allah Almighty (interpretation of the meaning): And that man shall have nothing but what he strives for, and the saying of the Prophet (peace and blessings be upon him): "When the son of Adam dies, his deeds come to an end except for three: ongoing charity, knowledge which is beneficial, or a righteous child who prays for him".

And in An-Nawawi's Fatawa (may Allah have mercy on him) page 83, Dar Al-Basha'ir edition, Beirut:

"Does the reward of what is given in charity on behalf of the deceased, or supplication, or recitation of the Quran, reach them?"

The answer: The reward of supplication and charity reaches by consensus.

They differed on the reward of recitation, Ahmad and some of Ash-Shafi`i's companions said: it reaches.

Ash-Shafi`i and the majority said: it does not reach". End quote

From the Shafi`is, some said that the reward of recitation reaches the deceased as mentioned by An-Nawawi, and some placed conditions for it to be so; that the reciter be present with the deceased, or intend it for them, or supplicate for him after the recitation, and that he assigns a similar reward for him, not the exact same reward.

Al-Khatib Al-Shirbini said in "Mughni al-Muhtaj" (4/110), Dar Al-Kutub Al-`Ilmiyah edition, Beirut, explaining the statement in Al-Minhaj: "Charity and supplication benefit the deceased whether from an heir or a stranger":

"Note: The author's statement may be understood to mean that the reward of other than that, such as praying on their behalf, whether making up missed prayers or others, and reciting the Quran, does not benefit the deceased. This is the well-known opinion among us, and it was transmitted by the author in Sharh Muslim and the Fatawa from Ash-Shafi`i – may Allah be pleased with him – and the majority.

The author of At-Talkhis made an exception for the prayer the two rak'ahs of Tawaf, and said: The hired person performs them on behalf of the one for whom he is performing Hajj, following the Tawaf, and they validated it.

Ibn `Abd As-Salam said in some of his Fatawa: It is not permissible to assign the reward of recitation to the deceased; because it is a disposition of the reward without the permission of the Legislator.

Al-Qurtubi narrated in At-Tadhkirah that he was seen in a dream after his death and was asked about that: He said: I used to say that in the world, and now it has become clear to me that the reward of recitation reaches the deceased.

The author mentioned in Sharh Muslim and Al-Adhkar an opinion: that the reward of recitation reaches the deceased like the opinion of the three Imams, and a group of companions chose it, including Ibn As-Salah, Al-Muhib At-Tabari, Ibn Abu Ad-Dam, the author of Adh-Dhakhir, Ibn Abu `Asrun, and this is what the people practice, and what the Muslims see as good is good in the sight of Allah, and As-Subki said: And what the report indicates by deduction is: that some of the Quran, if intended to benefit the deceased and alleviate what they are in, benefits them; as it is established that Al-Fatiha, when the reciter intended to benefit the one bitten, benefited him, and the Prophet – peace and blessings be upon him – approved it by saying: "And how do you know that it is a ruqyah?" and if it benefits the living by intention, then benefiting the deceased with it is more deserving.

Qadi Husayn permitted hiring reciters for recitation of the Quran at the deceased's side.

Ibn As-Salah said: It is appropriate to say: O Allah, convey the reward of what we have recited to so-and-so, thus making it a supplication, and there is no difference in this between relatives and non-relatives, and it is appropriate to say they benefit from this; because if supplication benefits and is permissible, for that which is not for the supplicant; then it is more appropriate to be permissible for what is for him, and this is not specific to recitation, but applies to all deeds". Eng quote

Jalal Al-Mahalli said in "Sharh Al-Minhaj" (3/176), Dar Al-Fikr edition, Beirut:

"Branch: The reward of recitation is for the reciter, and a similar reward also occurs for the deceased, but: if it is in their presence, or intended for them, or he assigns a similar reward for them after completing it, according to the relied upon (opinion) in that.

And the supplicant's saying: Assign the reward of that to so-and-so, means similarity".

Umayrah said in his commentary on it: "The text's statement: (And charity benefits the deceased) Az-Zarkashi said the meaning of that, according to the well-known opinion, is that the deceased becomes as if they gave in charity, i.e., unlike supplication, for it is intercession, its reward is for the intercessor, and its purpose is for the deceased. Then his generalization of charity includes endowment. Al-Rafi`i narrated it from the author of Al-Uddah regarding the endowment of the Mushaf, and said: Every endowment should follow that (rule).

The book's expression implied that recitation does not benefit the deceased, which is the well-known opinion; contrary to the three Imams.

However, a group of our Imams chose the reaching of the reward, including Ibn As-Salah. He said: And it is appropriate to say: O Allah, convey the reward of what we have recited to so-and-so.

He said: And the verse and the report do not indicate the invalidity of this; as for the verse, because the meaning is: he has no right, nor reward except in what he strives for, and what

others volunteer for him does not enter into that; because he has no right to it, nor is there recompense, but rather it is given to him voluntarily by another. And the hadith is about his deeds, and this is the deed of another.

And others interpreted the prohibition to mean when it is intended that the reward of recitation is for the deceased without supplication following it". End quote

In summary: The well-known opinion of the school is that the reward of recitation does not reach the deceased. And this is what is transmitted from the text of Ash-Shafi`i, and from the majority.

The second opinion in the school is that the reward of recitation reaches unconditionally, in agreement with the majority.

The third opinion is that it reaches with conditions.

And Allah knows best.