

480298 - Takbir for the prostration of recitation in the prayer

the question

he went to prostration when he reached the Ayat of sajdat al-tilaawah by saying Takbeer but he didn't say Takbeer when he came up from his sajdah (in salah). Then, he started reading the Quran again, and we all stood up by hearing his recitation. The following day, we gave him Islamqa.info fatwa regarding sajdat al-tilaawah in prayer . One week later he gave us a talk regarding this. During this talk, he mentioned a fatwa from al-Albani, in which he told us that Imam does not need to say Takbeer while coming up from the Sajdah in prayer. Since then, he has been doing the same practice in our Fajr prayer. please clarify whether any fatwa regarding this exist from Al-Albani?

Summary of answer

The majority of scholars are of the view that one should say takbir for the prostration of recitation in the prayer, when going down into prostration and when rising from it. This view is the more correct view regarding this issue, because it is in accordance with the general meaning of the hadiths about saying takbir in the prayer when moving up and down, and because we may draw an analogy with all the other prostrations in the prayer, and because there is a need for it, so that people can follow the imam in the prayer.

Detailed answer

Firstly:

Takbir for the prostration of recitation in the prayer is a matter concerning which scholarly views differ, and there is no proven hadith text which speaks specifically about it. The majority of scholars are of the view that the worshipper should say takbir for the prostration of recitation when going down into prostration and when rising from it.

Ibn Qudamah (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

If someone does the prostration of recitation, he should say takbir for prostrating and for rising from it, whether in prayer or otherwise. This is the view of Ibn Sirin, al-Hasan, Abu Qilabah, an-Nakha'i, Muslim ibn Yasar, Abu 'Abd ar-Rahman as-Sulami, ash-Shafa'i, Ishaq, and ashab ar-ra'y.

Malik said: That is if he is praying; it is different if he is not praying.

What supports our view is the report narrated by Ibn 'Umar, who said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) used to recite Qur'an for us, and if he came to a sajdah, he would say takbir and prostrate, and we would prostrate with him...

Moreover, because it is an isolated prostration, it is prescribed to say takbir at the beginning of it and when rising from it, as is the case with the prostration of forgetfulness (*sujud al-sahw*) after the salaam.

It is proven that the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said takbir in that case when prostrating and when rising from prostration.

Al-Khiraqi did not mention saying takbir for rising from prostration, but it was mentioned by others among our companions, and it is an analogy, as we mentioned above."(*Al-Mughni* 2/359).

The hadith of Ibn 'Umar mentioned above was narrated by Abu Dawud, no. 1413, via 'Abd ar-Razzaq, who said: 'Abdullah ibn 'Umar [al-'Umari] told us, from Nafi', from Ibn 'Umar, who said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) used to recite Qur'an to us, and if he came to a sajdah, he would say takbir and prostrate, and we would prostrate with him.

This hadith was deemed to be da'if (weak) by a number of scholars, because its isnad includes 'Abdullah al-'Umari, who is regarded as da'if. His brother 'Ubaydullah – who is trustworthy and reliable, and one of the most reliable and trustworthy narrators from Nafi' – disagreed with him. He narrated this hadith without any mention of takbir, as was narrated

by al-Bukhari (1075) and Muslim (575), from ‘Ubaydillah ibn ‘Umar, who said: Nafi’ told me, that Ibn ‘Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) used to recite Qur’an for us, and if he came to a sajdah, he would prostrate, and we would prostrate with him, until one of us could not find a space for his forehead.

Shaykh al-Albani (may Allah have mercy on him) said, regarding the isnad of the hadith narrated by Abu Dawud:

This is a layyin (“soft”) isnad – as al-Hafiz said in *Bulugh al-Maram* – and the problem with it is that ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Umar [al-‘Umari] is da‘if. Al-Bayhaqi did not comment on it, and Ibn al-Turkmani commented on that lack of comment in *al-Jawhar an-Naqi* where he said: Its isnad includes ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Umar, the brother of ‘Ubaydillah, about whom there is some criticism. Ibn al-Madini classed him as da‘if and Yahya ibn Sa‘id did not narrate from him. Ibn Hanbal said: He used to add to isnads. Salih ibn Muhammad said: He is layyin and is confused in his narration of hadith.

I say: His brother ‘Ubaydullah, who was trustworthy, differed from him. He narrated something similar from Nafi’ but did not mention takbir, as noted above in the hadith before it. This indicates that the mention of takbir in this report is something odd (munkar), according to the principles of ‘ilm al-hadith. And Allah knows best.”(*Irwa’ al-Ghalil* 2/224).

Rather the proof for it being prescribed to say takbir when doing the prostration of recitation in the prayer is to be found in the Prophet’s Sunnah, as the general meaning of some hadiths indicates that the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) used to say takbir with every movement up or down in the prayer.

For example, it is narrated by al-Bukhari (785) and Muslim (392) from Abu Salamah ibn ‘Abd ar-Rahman, from Abu Hurayrah, that he used to lead them in prayer. He said takbir every time he moved up or down, and when he finished he said: I am the one among you whose prayer most closely resembles that of the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him).

And it was narrated by at-Tirmidhi (253) and others that ‘Abdullah ibn Mas‘ud said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) used to say takbir every time he moved up or down, to stand or sit, and so did Abu Bakr and ‘Umar.

At-Tirmidhi said: Regarding this issue, there are reports from Abu Hurayrah, Anas, Ibn ‘Umar, Abu Malik al-Ash‘ari, Abu Musa, ‘Imran ibn Husayn, Wa’il ibn Hujr and Ibn ‘Abbas. The hadith of ‘Abdullah ibn Mas‘ud is a hasan sahih hadith, and the action of the Companions of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) was based on that, including the action of Abu Bakr, ‘Umar, ‘Uthman, ‘Ali and others, and the action of the Tabi‘in who came after them. This is the practice of the majority of jurists and scholars. End quote.

Secondly:

Shaykh al-Albani (may Allah have mercy on him) was of the view that the fact that there is no proven text that refers to saying takbir in this case indicates that it is not prescribed, and he regarded as da‘if the report about takbir in the hadith of Ibn ‘Umar. Based on that, [in his view] there should be no takbir for the prostration of recitation, either when going down into prostration or when rising from it.

He (may Allah have mercy on him) said, commenting on that in *Fiqh as-Sunnah*:

With regard to the prostration of recitation:

The words: “It was narrated that Ibn ‘Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) used to recite Qur’an for us, and if he came to a sajdah, he would say takbir and prostrate, and we would prostrate.” Narrated by Abu Dawud and al-Bayhaqi, and by al-Hakam, who said: It is sahih according to the conditions of al-Bukhari and Muslim.

I [al-Albani] say: There are two points to be noted regarding it:

The first point is that this hadith is da‘if, because its isnad in Abu Dawud – from whom al-Bayhaqi narrated it – includes ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Umar al-‘Umari, who is da‘if, as al-Hafiz said in

at-Talkhis. Hence he said in *Bulugh al-Maram*: Its isnad has some softness in it. An-Nawawi said in *al-Majmu'*:

Its isnad is da'if.

It was narrated from a number of the Sahabah that the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) prostrated for recitation in many verses, on different occasions, and none of them mentioned that he said takbir for this prostration. Hence we are inclined to say that it is not prescribed to say this takbir. This is one of the views narrated from Imam Abu Hanifah (may Allah have mercy on him). "(*Tamam al-Minnah fi't-Ta'liq 'ala Fiqh as-Sunnah* p. 267).

Thus Shaykh al-Albani did not think that this takbir is Sunnah, either when going down into prostration or rising from it, because there is no text which specifically mentions it.

And Allah knows best.